

Federalism in the Twenty-First Century: Trends and Prospects

Public Lecture by George Anderson
President, Forum of Federations

Santa Fe, Argentina
Friday, 23 March, 2007

What is federalism?

- Two orders of government (central/regional) each with independent powers
- Constitutionally created—not creature of other order (vs. unitary or confederal)
- Arbitration mechanism for constitution, usually a court
- Democratic: goes with divided power, rule of law
- Special federal protections: upper house; amendment formula; court composition; language

Variety of federations: societies

- 25 in world and 40% of population
- All democracies with very large populations or territories
- Some small countries with great social diversity: language, ethnicity, religion, regions
- High, middle and low income countries

Variety of federations: institutions

- Legislative-executive arrangements:
 - Parliamentary
 - Presidential
 - Mixed
- Upper houses:
 - directly-indirectly elected
 - powers
- Electoral and party systems
- Protections of minority rights
- Distribution of powers
- Fiscal sharing

Politics and Language

- Not all 25 federations always meet all elements of definition
- Experts sometimes disagree
- In some countries ‘federal’ carries negative political baggage: South Africa, Spain, Indonesia —even India
- Issue is not use of word ‘federal’, but value of ‘tool kit’ of federal techniques
- Every country must find its own formula

Classic Federations

- United States (1780)
- Switzerland (1848)
- Canada (1867)
- Australia (1901)
- Germany (1871-1918) (1948)
- Austria (1918-1933) (1945)

- All are now well established and successful but three broke down at some point in their history

Latin American Federations

- Venezuela (1811)
- Mexico (1824)
- Argentina (1853)
- Brazil (1891)

- History of military rule and major constitutional rewrites
- Transition to democracy in late twentieth century
 - All but Venezuela now quite stable democracies

Post-Colonial Federations

- **Continuing:**
 - India (1950)
 - Malaysia (1948 and 1963) (lost Singapore)
 - Nigeria (1954)
 - Pakistan (1956) (lost Bangladesh)
- **Failed**
 - West Indies (1958)
 - Indochina (1945-7)
 - French West Africa and Mali (1959)
 - Indonesia (1945-9)
 - Uganda
 - Central African Federation

New Wave of Federalism

- Post-Soviet federations
- Federations emerging from unitary regimes
- European Union
- Post-conflict situations

- Mixed picture regarding prospects

Federalism and the ex- Soviet Bloc

- Soviet Union, Yugoslavia and Czechoslovakia were nominal, not real, federations. Power was always centralized in the party and courts not independent.
- They did not survive the transition to democracy
- However, Russia, which was half the Soviet Union held together as a federation. Though Putin has moved to centralize, still a federation

New federations emerging peacefully from unitary systems

Established

- Belgium
- Spain
- South Africa
- United Kingdom?

Potential

- Philippines
- Indonesia
- Italy
- Bolivia

The European Union

- Unique regim
 - Federal: Parliament, Court
 - Confederal: Council of Ministers
- Central motivation was to bring peace to Europe but now much broader
- Started from different functional focus than most federations: economic, not defence and foreign policy

New federations emerging from post-conflict situations

Established

- Bosnia
- Ethiopia
- Iraq
- Sudan
- South Africa

Potential

- Sri Lanka
- Somalia
- Congo
- Cyprus
- Nepal

Bosnia

- Federal regime imposed by Dayton accord
- Very small country
- Elaborate mechanisms for protecting three communities at centre: not functional

Ethiopia

- Federal regime emerged from victorious revolution—liberation armies based in different regions
- Highly diverse society, undeveloped politics
- Significant push to develop regional structures and politics
- Still one party in control at both levels, but party competition becoming more active

Iraq

- Federalism only solution acceptable to Kurds
- Highly decentralized design but not yet implemented. Many unresolved issues
- Oil dependent state
- Emergence of sectarian politics
- An asymmetric model?

Sudan

- Federal solution central to Comprehensive Peace Agreement
- Special features:
 - Government of national unity
 - Eventual referendum on southern independence
 - South Sudan as federation within federation
 - Oil revenue sharing
- Transitional period before elections
- Unresolved problems of Darfur and North-east

South Africa

- African National Congress traditionally opposed federalism
- But agreed:
 - Inkatha
 - Europeans
 - Asians
- Needed to create provinces
- Successful transition to democracy

Innovations in New Federations

- Territorial and cultural federalism: Belgian model
- Asymmetry:
 - Spanish separate treaties with autonomous communities
 - UK: Scotland, Wales, Northern Ireland
 - Sudan: federation within a federation
- Constitution-making:
 - Reconciliation and constitution-making in South Africa
- Federalism at the centre
 - 50-50 Cabinet, ‘alarm bells’ in Belgium
 - Mixed executive in Iraq

Conditions for Federal Success

- Federal culture: can be very divided, but need some elements of shared identity and respect for difference, tolerance; cross-cutting cleavages
- Federal politics: rule of law, leaders (Nehru, Mandele, Trudeau), political game (peaceful, democratic)
- Federal techniques: fiscal federalism, ethnic and language laws, decentralization; consociationalism

Federalism and Democracy

- Federalism is a democractic form of government so the first pre-condition of federalism is a democractic environment.
- If this exists, the question becomes what will better 'fit' or stabilize a particular democracy: a unitary or federal form.
- Federalism is basic to the stability of many democracies

Federalism in 21st Century

- Federalism will receive more attention in 21st century because of
 - Democraticization in complex societies
 - International pressures to keep countries united
 - Push for local voice in established democracies
- Will be especially important in Africa and Asia: could a democratic China not be federal?
- However, federalism, like unitary regimes, cannot always succeed. Part of larger challenge of democracy