Benchmarking in a Shared Jurisdiction: Immigrant Settlement and Integration

Presented at the Conference on Benchmarking, Services to Citizens and Intergovernmental Relations

Queen’s University – October 19, 2012

Deborah Tunis
Director General
Integration Branch
Citizenship and Immigration Canada

Deb Zehr
Executive Director
Immigrant Integration Branch
British Columbia Ministry of Jobs, Tourism and Skills Training
Outline

1. Context

2. Examples of Benchmarking Initiatives

3. Pan-Canadian Framework for Settlement Outcomes

4. Lessons Learned
Context

Intake of Permanent Residents by Immigration Category – 1986 to 2010

CIC Spending Across Canada – 1991-92 to 2012-13
Context

- Federal, provincial and territorial (FPT) governments share responsibility

- Significant increase in immigrant intake and funding for settlement services

- Need to better demonstrate return on investment

- Benchmarking challenged by:
  - Difficulty in comparing to Canadian-born population
  - Multi-faceted settlement process (economic, social, civic/political)
  - Diversity of immigrant population
Examples of Benchmarking Initiatives

• Government benchmarking initiatives that have informed FPT work on settlement outcomes include:
  ➢ Federal Longitudinal Study of Immigrants to Canada (LSIC)
  ➢ Federal Evaluation of the Provincial Nominee Program (PNP)
  ➢ British Columbia’s Welcoming Communities Survey

• FPT governments are now collaborating on the development of:
  ➢ Pan-Canadian Framework for Settlement Outcomes
Federal Longitudinal Survey of Immigrants to Canada (LSIC)

- Early attempt at measuring all areas of settlement with a larger population
- Focused on how new immigrants adjusted to life in Canada over time and what factors influenced this adjustment
- Conducted in three waves
- Findings:
  - Difficulties in securing suitable employment
  - Necessity of official language ability in finding an adequate job
- LSIC discontinued with improvements to General Social Survey
Federal Evaluation of the Provincial Nominee Program (PNP)

- Example of benchmarking newcomers’ economic outcomes and mobility
- Focused on provincial nominees (PNs) admitted during 2005-2009
- Findings:
  - Increased regionalization
  - Vast majority report earnings each year
  - Majority work at a skill level equivalent to their intended occupation
- However, economic outcomes vary by province and stream.
- Recommendations:
  - Minimum language standards for all PNs
  - Stronger links between PN occupations and local labour market needs
  - A common PNP monitoring and reporting framework for accountability
- Next evaluation planned in 5 years with efforts to secure interim data
British Columbia’s Welcoming Communities Survey

• BC began building its approach to performance measurement ten years ago.

• In 2008, BC began work to better understand:
  - the concept of welcoming communities
  - its impact on newcomers’ settlement and integration experience.

• In 2009, BC undertook a two-phased survey to support evidence-based policy by:
  - Developing BC-specific research on welcoming communities and attitudes towards immigration
  - Identifying societal-level impacts of welcoming communities initiatives
  - Developing driver models through structural equation modelling to support program and policy design
In total, three models developed:
- “Putting Down Roots in the Community” model for recent immigrants
- “Deepening the Roots in the Community” model for long-term immigrants
- “Building the Bridge of Community Cohesion” model for visible minority
Pan-Canadian Framework for Settlement Outcomes

**Background**

- December 2009 – FPT Deputy Ministers seek better understanding and improvement of settlement outcomes
- Work undertaken by FPT Settlement Working Group
- Taking Stock report identified the need for a national set of settlement and integration outcomes
- FPT Ministers endorsed a plan to create a pan-Canadian framework for settlement outcomes
- Goal statements, outcomes and indicators were then jointly developed
Pan-Canadian Framework for Settlement Outcomes

**National Set of Settlement Outcomes**

**Goal Statement:** Newcomers acquire the knowledge, skills and experience to be able to fully participate in Canada’s society and economy, and Canada welcomes and includes newcomers.

1. Newcomers understand life in Canada.
2. Newcomers know how to access public services and community resources.
3. Newcomers have the official language skills to function in Canadian society and the labour market.
4. Newcomers have knowledge of the Canadian work environment and are aware of local labour markets.
5. Newcomers have the skills to become employed in their chosen occupation.
6. Newcomers are connected to social and economic networks as well as the broader community.
7. People, communities and workplaces are welcoming and inclusive of newcomers.
Pan-Canadian Framework for Settlement Outcomes

*Settlement Outcomes Measurement – Survey*

- Settlement and integration part of a continuum
  - Settlement outcomes: new data collection
  - Integration outcomes: existing data sources
- Settlement Outcomes Survey – 20,000 newcomers across Canada who landed during last five years (regardless of whether they have accessed settlement services)
- Analysis will include structural equation modelling
- Questionnaire based on national set of outcomes, literature review and pilot testing
- Sample points reallocated from larger jurisdictions to smaller ones for optimal results in each jurisdiction
Pan-Canadian Framework for Settlement Outcomes

Settlement Outcomes Measurement – Results

• National results in Winter 2013 and jurisdictional results in Spring 2013

• Dataset large enough to start benchmarking and analysis:
  - At the societal (rather than program) level
  - On a range of complex issues (including social, political and economic participation)

• Results will inform the Pan-Canadian Framework for Settlement Outcomes and the development of a roadmap for improved outcomes across Canada
Lessons Learned

• Experience with the Pan-Canadian Framework for Settlement Outcomes has shown benchmarking impacts on:

  ➢ FPT relations
  ➢ Resources
  ➢ Decision making
  ➢ Potential for improved outcomes and services
Lessons Learned

**Impact on FPT Relations**

- Work on settlement outcomes has strengthened FPT partnership and collaboration
- FPT relations challenged by differing mandates, interests and capacities
- Success achieved through:
  - Leadership of federal and provincial co-chairs
  - Input from all jurisdictions
  - Patience
  - Commitment
  - Regular communication (in person and by teleconference)
- A model for future collaboration in areas such as improving coordination of settlement service delivery and developing new partnership models
Lessons Learned

**Impact on Resources**

- Jurisdictions have varied capacity for benchmarking
- FPT collaboration allows all jurisdictions to benefit from benchmarking and contribute to it
- CIC provides funding and secretariat support
- BC leads implementation of the Settlement Outcomes Survey
- As a national initiative, the survey is cost-effective by:
  - Avoiding duplication between regional surveys
  - Increasing value for money since all data will be comparable across the country
Lessons Learned

*Impact on Decision Making*

- Still in data collection stage

- Results will be based on:
  - National set of settlement outcomes
  - Driver model for settlement

- Once collected, results will provide:
  - Comparable data on newcomer outcomes for all jurisdictions
  - Evidence base for new policy and program decisions
Lessons Learned

*Potential for Improved Outcomes and Services*

- All jurisdictions will have a common understanding of:
  - What settlement is
  - What successful settlement should look like
- FPT governments will collaborate on a roadmap for improving newcomers outcomes.
- Will help ensure that newcomers have access to comparable levels of service across Canada
- Flexibility for different jurisdictions to pursue their own policy and program directions while meeting the same goals
  - Allows for a federated response to complex national issues
For Further Information


- Questions regarding BC’s Welcoming Communities Survey and the Settlement Outcomes Survey may be directed to:
  
  Angela Matheson  
  Manager of Public Sector Research and Evaluation  
  BC Stats  
  [angela.matheson@gov.bc.ca](mailto:angela.matheson@gov.bc.ca)

- Information on BC’s Welcoming and Inclusive Communities and Workplaces Program is available at [http://www.welcomebc.ca/wbc/service_providers/programs/welcome_program/index.page](http://www.welcomebc.ca/wbc/service_providers/programs/welcome_program/index.page)

- Information on BC’s Client Satisfaction Surveys is available at [http://www.welcomebc.ca/wbc/service_providers/programs/settlement_program/reports/clientsat.page](http://www.welcomebc.ca/wbc/service_providers/programs/settlement_program/reports/clientsat.page)