



The
University
Of
Sheffield.

Dissecting the 18th Amendment: The structure of the federation

Dr Katharine Adeney
Department of Politics
University of Sheffield



Structures of federalism

- Federal structures can vary massively
- Federalism is never a one size fits all solution, and nor should it be
- This presentation focuses on
 - Representation of provinces at the centre
 - Number of provinces
 - Symmetry/Asymmetry



Representation of provinces

- NA on basis of population
 - Punjab majority
 - Has implications for the party system
- Senate equality representation
 - Has been empowered
 - Still no power on finance bills



Number of provinces

- History of unit design
- Number of provinces
- Periodic calls for increasing the number of provinces
- Recently Seraiki and Hazara come again to prominence
- Link to FATA debate?



The
University
Of
Sheffield.

Federal Failures and the no. of units 1900-2008

Units	Federal States	Federal Failures	% of failures
2-3	16	12	75
4-7	10	5	50
8-12	5	1	20
➤ 13	15	2	13
Totals	46	20	43



Advantages

- Bring government closer to the people
- Development issues
- Divides 'destabilising' majority
 - NA
 - NFC
- Addresses longstanding demands
- Can increase national integration
 - Pride in Pakistan 87%
 - Balochis (75%), Hindus (74%), Sindhis (72%)

	Only national	More national than regional	Equal	More regional than national	Only Regional	No Opinion
Pakistan	40	14	12	6	20	8
Urdu	60	8	9	4	16	3
Hindko	51	19	7	9	11	3
Punjabi	47	17	12	4	15	5
Pushto	33	16	17	5	22	7
Seraiki	32	10	13	10	29	6
Sindhi	23	11	8	9	36	14
Balochi	18	18	16	3	17	28

Source, State of Democracy in South Asia Survey, conducted 2005



Challenges

- Who draws the boundaries?
- Will it increase tensions?
 - Between provinces
 - Within provinces
- Can only be done as part of a wider reform process
 - can't simply divide Punjab on its own
 - should not be piecemeal/party political



Symmetry/Asymmetry

- Many federations have asymmetrical relationships
 - Different levels of autonomy
 - Different governing structures
- Gilgit-Baltistan, Azad Kashmir, FATA
- Fits within the number of provinces debate



Conclusions

- Major reforms
 - consolidate?
 - take window of opportunity?
- Structures are important, but so is their operation
- Perceptions are as important as realities